MYNYDD MAEN WIND FARM

COMMON LAND REPORT TO SUPPORT AN APPLICATION UNDER SECTION 38 OF THE COMMONS ACT 2006



DATE OF REPORT: 15th January 2024

Prepared on behalf of: Renewable Energy Systems Ltd, Beaufort Court, Egg Farm Lane, Station Road, Kings Langley, Hertfordshire, WD4 8LR

Prepared by: Watts & Morgan LLP 55A High Street, Cowbridge, Vale of Glamorgan, CF71 7AE

Contents

1.0	Introduction	4
2.0	Policy Guidance	6
3.0	Mynydd Maen Wind Farm	8
4.0	The Common	11
5.0	Common Land Considerations	13
6.0	Conclusions	15

Appendices

- Appendix 1 Plan of Mynydd Maen Common incorporating CL25, CL26, CL27, CL28
- Appendix 2 Welsh Government Guidance
- Appendix 3 Photographs of the Temporary Construction Area
- Appendix 4 Ecology Technical Note for the Temporary Construction Area
- Appendix 5 Hefting Plan

1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 This report has been prepared by Watts & Morgan, on behalf of Renewable Energy Systems Ltd (RES) to support a secondary application to accompany an application for a Development of National Significance (DNS) to construct and operate Mynydd Maen wind farm.
- 1.2 As part of these proposals, RES (the Applicant) is including land that is currently designated common land at Mynydd Maen common (which encompasses commons CL25, CL26, CL27 and CL28). A plan showing the extent of the common is included at Appendix 1.
- 1.3 The commons at CL25, CL26, CL27 and CL28 have been described in the report as Mynydd Maen Common both for ease of reference and because this is how they are known locally. Their Common names in accordance with the commons register are as outlined below:
 - CL25 Mynydd Maen and Mynydd Llwyd
 - CL26 Edlogan Common
 - CL27 -Magna Porta Common
 - CL28- Mynydd Henllys Common

The wind farm comprising 13 wind turbines with associated access tracks, substation and turbine bases are proposed on common land and, therefore, in line with the DNS criteria set out in Regulation 4 of The Development of National Significance (Specified Criteria and Prescribed Secondary Consents) (Wales) Regulations 2016 as amended, secondary applications will be made to Planning and Environment Decisions Wales (PEDW).

- 1.4 A secondary application will be submitted under Section 38 of the Commons Act 2006 to enable the temporary construction works to be carried out. A common land report is commissioned to cover the following (which elaborates on the information included in the application form:
 - 1.4.1 To advise on what potential impacts could arise for current users of the common (commoners, landowners and public) because of the works to be undertaken during construction of the proposed wind farm. This relates to the area that is to be temporarily used during construction of the wind farm only which may have the effect of preventing or impeding access or involve resurfacing of the common.
 - 1.4.2 Use of the common by commoners and the public the report needs to consider how the temporary construction areas are currently used and how its temporary loss will affect access and use of the common.
 - 1.4.3 Conclude whether the temporary loss of the construction area will adversely affect the interests of the commoners, landowners and the public.

- 1.5 The extent of the temporary construction area is 44.32 hectares (ha) which is as shown shaded in magenta on the plan at Appendix 1.
- 1.6 This report considers the type and quality of land required temporarily for use during construction of the wind farm and the impact of the proposals upon the exercise of the rights of the commoners and public. Throughout the works this land will remain as common land with any impact upon rights of access and amenity being negligible and temporary for the duration of the construction of the wind farm only.

2.0 Policy Guidance

Full details of the relevant policy guidance relating to common land applications is included in Appendix 2.

2.1 Section 38 Commons Act 2006

- 2.1.1 To allow works to take place on the common an application must be submitted under Section 38 of the Commons Act 2006. Works cannot commence on a common in Wales without the permission of the Welsh Government.
- 2.1.2 The generating capacity of the proposals will exceed 10MW and, as such, the application qualifies as a DNS. As part of this application, RES is required to secure this secondary consent to allow works to take place on the common.

2.2 Welsh Government Guidance

- 2.2.1 Guidance on the determination of common land applications was published by the Welsh Government in August 2014. The document is titled 'Common Land Consents Guidance' and gives helpful advice on how such applications will be assessed and determined. It is a helpful guidance tool for those preparing applications to be considered and determined by Welsh Minsters.
- 2.2.2 Guidance states that key to the determination of the application under Section 38 are the following considerations:
 - (a) The interests of persons having rights in relation to, or occupying the land (and in particular, persons exercising rights of common over it);
 - (b) The interests of the neighbourhood;
 - (c) The public interest; and
 - (d) Any other matter considered to be relevant.
- 2.2.3 Paragraphs 3.9.1 to 3.9.4 state that the following matters are important to the use of common land by commoners and should be considered by the decision maker when determining applications:
 - (a) What effect do the proposals have on the ability of commoners or other rights holders (including the landowner) to exercise their rights?
 - (b) What alternatives have been explored that might reduce the impact of the proposals on the exercise of commoners' rights?
 - (c) What effect will the proposals have on other rights holders, such as those with rights of access across the common?

- 2.2.4 In response to guidance and to expand on the questions posed in the application forms to support this application, this report covers the following:
 - (a) The proposed works on the common;
 - (b) The existing rights over the common and the extent to which they are exercised;
 - (c) Whether there will be an impact upon grazing;
 - (d) The potential disturbance during the construction period and measures to mitigate any disruption.

3.0 Mynydd Maen Wind Farm

3.1 The Proposed Scheme

- 3.1.1 The application proposes a wind farm development at Mynydd Maen, consisting of thirteen wind turbines, each with a three-bladed rotor and maximum height to blade tip of 149.9 metres (m). The application also comprises associated infrastructure including:
 - Access works improvement to the existing access together with new and improved internal wind farm tracks within the common;
 - (b) Crane pads at each turbine location;
 - (c) Turbine foundations;
 - (d) Underground power cables linking the turbines and the on-site substation;
 - (e) Temporary construction compounds, laydown areas and storage areas;
 - (f) Temporary borrow pits;
 - (g) Grid connection infrastructure including the on-site substation, control building and overhead lines linking the substation to the distribution network.
- 3.1.2 As set out above, the proposals qualify as a DNS. The application is also Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) development and is, therefore, supported by an Environmental Statement (ES) covering a variety of environmental and technical information, including an assessment on noise, landscape and visual impact, ecology, drainage, shadow flicker and heritage.
- 3.1.3 All of the turbines and infrastructure are proposed to be constructed on Mynydd Maen common.
- 3.1.4 The extent and location of the temporary construction area is as shown coloured magenta at Appendix 1.
- 3.1.5 Once constructed all areas required for temporary uses, for example construction compounds, lay down areas, crane pads, borrow pits will be fully reinstated and made available to all users of the common.

3.2 The Site

- 3.2.1 The application site is situated on a plateau overlooking the larger settlements of Cwmbran to the east and Newport to the south. It is surrounded by various settlements and farms with the Cwmcarn Forest and scenic drive situated immediately adjoining the western boundary. The site is situated within the administrative boundaries of Caerphilly County Borough Council and Torfaen County Borough Council.
- 3.2.2 The site is accessed via an unnamed public highway to the west of the site, known locally as the Mountain Road. The highway connects via Old Pant Road and Central Avenue to the A467 near Newbridge.
- 3.2.3 The temporary construction area comprises an area of approximately 44.32 hectares as shown at Appendix 1. The temporary construction area is situated wholly within Mynydd Maen common.
- 3.2.4 The construction activities which will include wind turbine foundation construction may result in small areas of land being temporarily inaccessible to the general public and livestock.
- 3.2.5 Where access is restricted, temporary 1.2m high stock proof fencing will be erected to prevent the general public and livestock from entering the works. Construction personnel and traffic will access the works via pedestrian and vehicular gates.
- 3.2.6 Fencing will only be erected where necessary, on a rolling basis, for the protection of the general public and livestock, and will be taken down when not required, to minimise the length of fencing at any one time during construction.
- 3.2.7 It is estimated that approximately 2,500m of temporary fencing will be required during the wind farm construction but not all at the same time.

3.3 Mynydd Maen Common

- 3.3.1 Mynydd Maen common incorporates common land areas CL25, CL26, CL27 and CL28 as shown edged and hatched dark green on the plan at Appendix 1.
- 3.3.2 Mynydd Maen common extends to 1128.28 hectares situated in a single block as shown on the plan at Appendix 1.
- 3.3.3 The common comprises a significant area and is mostly situated on a plateau up to 472 metres above sea level overlooking Cwmbran to the east and Newport to the south.

3.4 Temporary Construction Area

- 3.4.1 The temporary construction area as shown on the plan at Appendix 1 comprises an irregularly shaped area of land which follows the proposed route of the wind farm access road and turbine locations.
- 3.4.2 The temporary construction area comprises predominantly poor unimproved grassland which is covered partly in fern, heather and rush with areas of self-sown trees which have grown as a result of reduced grazing. The temporary construction areas have been inspected with photographs attached in Appendix 3 showing the 3 proposed borrow pit

locations and the turbine/substation locations. The borrow pit locations are as further described below: -

- 3.4.2.1 <u>Easterly Borrow Pit</u> Situated on a level area of open heath land, no obvious signs of public access.
- 3.4.2.2 <u>Northerly Borrow Pit</u> Situated on a level area of open heath land very similar to the Easterly Borrow Pit.
- 3.4.2.3 <u>Westerly Borrow Pit</u> Situated in an area of open level grassland which appears to be mown and maintained by the commoners, situated near the Coed Cae Watkin Dafydd replacement land area.
- 3.4.2.5 <u>Turbine locations</u> Varying in topography and condition with some areas of heavy heather making access by foot very difficult.
- 3.4.3 The temporary construction areas are further described in the Ecology Technical Note attached in Appendix 4.

4.0 The Common

4.0.1 To support the secondary application, RES has consulted the commoners and users of the common and undertaken survey work to understand the use of the common and to assess the quality of the temporary construction area.

4.1 Consultation

- 4.1.1 Prior to the formal process of statutory pre-application consultation, RES has been consulting on the proposals for development on the common at Mynydd Maen. Early engagement included consultation with a number of public and private organisations, including the commoners. The wider public, including all residential properties within 2km of the proposed site, were consulted and invited to share their thoughts on the proposals.
- 4.1.2 The applicant has sought to consult with those currently using the common to gather feedback on the proposals to understand any concerns and to minimise impact and maximise any potential benefits through the process. The statutory pre-application consultation process will support the ongoing consultation on this aspect of the proposals and a separate consultation report will be prepared to support the final submission.
- 4.1.3 The applicant has consulted and engaged with a range of statutory and non-statutory consultees, local communities, organisations and individuals on the application proposals. Early engagement with the local planning authorities, community and interested parties began in November 2021 and is ongoing, through a range of consultation activities. An online public exhibition was held on the dedicated Mynydd Maen project website in March 2022 and in-person public exhibitions were held in the local area, in June 2023. In addition, the applicant has established a Community Liaison Group comprising a number of locally elected representatives.
- 4.1.4 Meetings were held with members of the Mynydd Maen Commoners Association in August 2021, May 2022, January 2023 and August 2023. Further consultation will take place as part of the statutory consultation process.

4.2 Surveys

4.2.1 The extent of the common, which includes the temporary construction area, has been inspected over a number of years as part of the ecological survey work undertaken to support the application. The survey work was undertaken on foot, looking at physical features, biodiversity and topography.

4.3 Landowners

4.3.1 The freehold owners of the common at Mynydd Maen (CL25, CL26, CL27 and CL28), including the temporary construction area that is the subject of this application are Llanover Estate and Pontypool Park Estate.

4.4 Land Occupiers

4.4.1 The occupiers of the common land are the registered commoners of CL25, CL26, CL27 and CL28. The registered commoners are members of the Mynydd Maen Commoners Association. The commons register is maintained by the Local Authority with there being currently registered grazing rights to 55 separate holdings that the Applicant is aware of.

These rights are set out below: -

- CL25 4692 units over 19 holdings where one ewe and her lambs count as one unit and one horse or head of cattle counts as five units.
- CL26 over 15 holdings. The right to graze 2310 sheep, 128 cattle, 45 horses/ponies, 16 pigs, 34 geese, 50 poultry and 5 rights to cut rush and bracken.
- CL27 over 10 holdings. The right to graze 1170 sheep, 45 cattle, 17 horses/ponies, 1 right of piscary and 1 right to shoot.

CL28 – over 11 holdings. The right to graze 2780 sheep, 16 cattle.

- 4.4.2 The consultation process has highlighted that grazing rights have been, and are being, exercised on Mynydd Maen on a regular basis either as periodic or active graziers. The livestock are hefted over the large area of common land as there are no physical boundaries.
- 4.4.3 The number of graziers and the volume of stock that graze the common varies on an annual basis and within any grazing season.

4.5 Public Access

- 4.5.1 The Countryside and Rights of Way (CROW) Act 2000 provides rights of access to public areas defined as access land which includes registered common areas. If required during construction, for safety reasons, the temporary construction area will be temporarily fenced off.
- 4.5.2 From our own observations and various discussions, the main public uses on the common are for rambling, horse riding and mountain biking.
- 4.5.4 There are Public Rights of Way within the temporary construction area these are shown as dark green dashed lines on the plan in Appendix 1. Where the construction of the turbines and access tracks affects these rights of way then applications will be made, where necessary, to the local authorities for the rights of way to be diverted on a permanent or temporary basis.
- 4.5.5 Use of the common for equine use is limited to amenity use under a permissive right granted by the landowners. Having visited the site on several occasions, the use of the common for equine purposes is minimal and spread out across the whole common without any defined areas of use.
- 4.5.6 Use of the common by mountain bikes is commonplace albeit it appears to be more prevalent to the south of the common on CL28 where the common adjoins the Cwmcarn scenic drive and Cwmbran areas. The impact of the wind farm upon mountain bike use is likely to be negligible.

5.0 Common Land Considerations

5.1 Mynydd Maen Commoners Association

- 5.1.1 The occupiers of the common land are the registered commoners of CL25, CL26, CL27 and CL28. The registered commoners are members of the Mynydd Maen Commoners Association. Regular consultations have been carried out with the officers of the Commoners Association since May 2022.
- 5.1.2 The Commons Register as overseen by the Local Authority has been inspected. Rights are currently registered to 55 separate holdings on the Register for CL25, CL26, CL27 and CL28. The rights exist as shown under paragraph 4.4.1

5.2 Current Grazing Patterns/Use of the Common

- 5.2.1 Conversations and consultations since May 2022 have identified nine main active graziers of the common land areas who are regularly using the common for the grazing of livestock.
- 5.2.2 The majority of the active graziers are currently grazing the common subject to the terms of a Glastir Agreement which has been entered into by the active graziers with the Welsh Government whereby the common is left vacant between 1st January and 1st April in each calendar year. Livestock return to the common on 1st April and the common is usually grazed during the summer months. Stocking levels are normally reduced in October when ewes are brought onto in bye land and put to the ram. All livestock are then removed from the common on 31st December to comply with the Glastir conditions.
- 5.2.3 The Common is managed as a hefted common both in respect of cattle and sheep. A heft is an area of the common which has been used by the respective flock/herd for generations and flocks/herds tend to graze the respective areas that they are hefted to without straying onto other hefts and mixing with other flocks. The hefted areas are as shown on the hefting plan which is attached to this report at Appendix 5.
- 5.2.4 As shown on the hefting plan the main proposed construction area for the wind farm is within the hefted areas of Howard Vicary, Annette Davies and Andrew Taylor. Howard Vicary is by far the largest grazier on the common and either rents or owns grazing rights from up to twelve different holdings adjoining the common. In addition, he manages Annette Davies' heft on her behalf as she is unable to do so herself. Andrew Taylor who is also listed on the hefting plan is a part time farmer and grazier and intermittently grazes the common with up to sixty ewes.
- 5.2.5 Howard Vicary grazes the common in accordance with the terms of the Glastir Agreement. This has been in situ since 2011. At present under the terms of the Glastir Agreement Howard Vicary keeps approximately 800 ewes on the common during the grazing year. These grazing levels are not consistent throughout the year with approximately 400 yearlings being brought onto the common on 1st April with the ewes and lambs to follow normally in late April when the lambs are strong enough.

The commoners usually gather in the first week of July for shearing and again in

mid August to wean the lambs following which the ewes are returned to the common. The ewes are normally gathered in mid October to return to in bye land to put them to the ram. They are not normally returned to the common until 1st April the following year. Some dry/baron ewes may remain on the common until 31st December at which time the common is fully vacated. Howard Vicary keeps approximately 70 cattle on the common with two other graziers namely Rob Tunley keeping approximately 25 cattle and Mark Stokes approximately 12 cattle.

5.2.6 The grazing of the common is currently restricted by the terms of the Glastir Agreement and should the Glastir Agreement end or expire without renewal then stocking levels may increase. The terms of the Glastir Agreement have currently been extended to December 2023 and an application has been made to the transition Habitat scheme for 2024 under which the same grazing restrictions apply.

5.3 Impact of Construction of the Wind Farm upon use of the Common

- 5.3.1 It is accepted that disturbance from the construction works and vehicle movements may be caused to existing farming patterns on the common. Partly due to Glastir and partly due to a long term decline in the number of active graziers on the common, the common has been undergrazed for a number of years. The construction areas are situated centrally with significant peripheral areas either side and whereas there will be disturbance to hefts on the common it is considered that the impact upon the existing grazing patterns will be limited.
- 5.3.2 It is accepted that construction works on the common will temporarily interfere with existing public access on the common albeit there is substantial peripheral land either side of the proposed working areas which will not be impacted upon by the construction works and will be available for users of the common to include all forms of public access notably walking, horse riding and mountain bike riding. It is considered therefore that current levels of the common may be maintained by all users whilst the construction works are ongoing.

5.4 Impact Upon the Common following completion of Construction and Commissioning of the Wind Farm

- 5.4.1 Following construction of the wind farm all construction areas will be fully reinstated with all temporary fencing and hard standing areas removed.
- 5.4.2 All borrow pits areas will be fully reinstated to existing levels and returned to existing use.

6.0 Conclusions

- 6.1 The application under Section 38 of the Commons Act 2006 will be submitted seeking secondary consent to the main DNS application for Mynydd Maen Wind Farm.
- 6.2 This report assesses the quality and type of common land which is to form part of the temporary construction area.
- 6.3 The overall area of Mynydd Maen Common extends to 1128.28 hectares.
- 6.4 The temporary construction area extends to 44.32 hectares which is approximately 3.9% of the area of the common.
- 6.5 The temporary construction area, although irregular in shape, is for the most part situated in a narrow corridor following the location of the wind turbines and access tracks.
- 6.6 The narrow shape of the temporary construction area means that it is spread out over a large part of the common therefore minimizing the impact upon any one specific area.
- 6.7 The temporary construction area will be fenced in certain areas for health and safety purposes only with the rest of it remaining open to the other users of the common including the public, commoners and livestock.
- 6.8 Where necessary, crossing points will be installed into temporary fencing to minimize the impact upon grazing of and access through the common.
- 6.9 Where the temporary construction area affects any public rights of way situated on the common, applications will be made where necessary for public rights of way to be diverted either on a permanent or temporary basis.
- 6.10 From our observations on the common and various discussions with the commers and other users, the main public uses on the common are for rambling, horse riding and mountain biking. Both rambling and horse riding are spread out over the whole of the common so any impact of the works will be negligible. Mountain biking is mostly situated to the south of the common on CL28 which does not form part of the temporary construction area.
- 6.11 Following construction, the temporary construction area will be fully reinstated to its previous use and condition.
- 6.12 Based on our findings we consider that the use of the temporary construction area will have a negligible effect on the users of the common. It will affect a very small part of the overall common and will be spread out over a large area therefore minimising any impact upon any one part of the common. Crossing points will be used where necessary to minimise the impact upon grazing and the temporary construction area will be fully reinstated on completion of the construction of the wind farm and thereby returning the land to its existing use and condition.

Appendix 1

Plan of Mynydd Maen Common Incorporating CL25, CL26, CL27, CL28



Appendix 2

Welsh Government Guidance

Welsh Government – Common Land Consents Guidance

Introduction

The Planning Inspectorate in Wales (PINS Wales) is responsible for the procedural work for all of the Welsh Ministers' casework in relation to common land in Wales (including applications for exchange of land in respect of town or village greens) as well as determining, on behalf of the Welsh Ministers, applications for consent under section 38(1) of the Commons Act 2006 ("the 2006 Act"). PINS Wales' responsibility for procedural work also relates to the Welsh Ministers' consents, certificates and orders under various other statutory provisions in relation to common land and town or village greens identified in paragraph 4.15 below. The Deputy Minister for Agriculture and Fisheries retains responsibility for the Welsh Government's policy in relation to the management and protection of common land and greens.

1 The Guidance

1.1 This note sets out the Welsh Government's guidance in relation to the determination of such casework and is published for the guidance of the Welsh Ministers, PINS Wales, commons registration authorities and applicants for consent. It may also be of assistance to those interested in such applications (perhaps as supporters or objectors).

1.2 The Welsh Ministers and PINS Wales seek to adhere to this guidance in processing and determining applications under section 38(1) and section 16(1) and, so far as is relevant, in relation to other statutory provisions (see paragraph 4.15 below). Every application to the Welsh Ministers must, however, be considered on its own merits and a determination may, in exceptional circumstances, depart from the guidance if it appears appropriate to do so. In such cases, the decision maker will explain why it has decided not to follow the guidance.

1.3 This guidance must be read in conjunction with the 2006 Act, other legislation relevant to the type of application being considered, and the guidance notes published by PINS Wales in relation to particular types of application. The guidance notes are published on the website of PINS Wales, at:

http://www.planningportal.gov.uk/planning/countryside/commonland/commonl and

2 Why is common land important?

2.1 The aim of the Welsh Government's Natural Resource Management Programme is to ensure that we make the most of Wales' natural resources while looking after natural systems and building their resilience and continuing to provide the benefits to people, communities and the economy in Wales in the long term. That is particularly relevant to common land as around 8% of the land area of Wales is common land, with approximately 45% of common land lying within a National Park and approximately 45% included in Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI).

2.2 Many commons form vital parts of the local economy by maintaining a living for commoners who use the areas to graze their stock; providing employment and generating income for sporting uses; providing an attractive backdrop to some of our most beautiful and popular tourist areas; and by preserving examples of the country's heritage, with internationally important archaeological sites and historic landscapes.

2.3 Individual commoners who still exercise their rights are maintaining a tradition that has been in existence for hundreds of years. This is particularly important in upland areas where commons form a vital element in the local agricultural economy.

2.4 Some of the varied benefits we wish to see our common land delivering are:

Economic

- maintaining a living for commoners who use common land to graze livestock, often with consequential benefits to the wider rural community;
- providing employment and generating income from sporting use
- providing aesthetic beauty in the landscape, which encourages tourism;

Agriculture

- ensuring upland farms can rely on the grazing of common land, which is a significant component of livestock production in Wales;
- maintaining local infrastructure and expertise capable of long term sustainable agricultural management;

Biodiversity

- maintaining natural vegetation rich in flora and fauna;
- protecting a diversity of habitat (on common land, the diversity reflects the lack of incentive to "improve" such land because of the absence of any single controlling interest);
- promoting Sites of Special Scientific Interest and the conservation of other nationally designated sites;
- sustaining grazing systems which are responsible for maintaining many landscape and environmental values on agriculturally-active commons;

Archaeological

- preserving landforms and features in unploughed soils (common land and greens have often been undisturbed for centuries);
- protection of important archaeological and historic sites;

Recreation

- enjoyment of the landscape by visitors and tourists;
- providing open space for surrounding communities;
- use for a wide range of organised activities and local traditional activities;
- commons which are sporting estates contributing to the local economy;

Cultural

- common land and greens providing focus of communities for ancient and traditional activities;
- long-standing traditions associated with the use of common land and greens; and
- increasing the value of open, unenclosed common land and greens as a *de facto* "communal" resource and providing a sense of belonging.

3 Protecting commons — our policy objectives

3.1 The Welsh Government's desire to protect commons contributes to a number of its strategic objectives:

- reversing the decline of and securing the resilience of our biodiversity by focusing on ecosystems as a whole and their connection with our economy and our communities; and
- through sustainable use of our resources the opportunity to drive growth and exploit new markets, increase efficiency and improve the resilience, safety and prosperity of our communities, our economy and our environment.
- 3.2 Within those objectives the Welsh Government wishes to see:
 - Soil and land managed sustainably;
 - Biodiversity valued, safeguarded and enhanced;
 - People enjoy, understand and care for the natural environment;
 - Improved local environment quality;
 - Designated sites either in good condition or improving; and
 - Sustainable, living landscapes with best features conserved.

3.3 The 2006 Act, along with a suite of earlier legislation on common land, enables the Welsh Government to:

- Safeguard commons for current and future generations to use and enjoy;
- Ensure that the special qualities of common land, including its open and unenclosed nature, are properly protected; and
- Increase the number of Sites of Special Scientific Interest in favourable condition.

3.4 To achieve this we have a consent/approval process in place to ensure the following outcomes are achieved:

- our stock of common land and greens is not diminished that, on balance, any deregistration of registered land is balanced by the registration of other land of at least equal benefit;
- works take place on common land only when they maintain or improve the condition of the common or, in exceptional circumstances, where they confer some wider public benefit and are either temporary in duration or have no lasting impact; and
- any use of the common or green is consistent with its status (as common land or green).

3.5 Sections 16(6) and 39(1) of the Act set out the criteria to which the Welsh Ministers must have regard when assessing an application. In applying the criteria the Welsh Ministers will look at the application not only as it is, but will consider whether the application proposes the best possible outcome. It may be that a more acceptable outcome could be achieved by adopting a different approach.

3.6 For example, an application relates to works at point A, and the evidence suggests the works would have a reduced impact on public access and nature conservation if erected at point B (and there is no reason why the works could not be erected at point B). In cases where the Welsh Ministers are satisfied that there is a better approach it is open to them either to impose conditions to improve the outcome or to refuse consent for the application before them, where they are satisfied after applying the statutory criteria that there are good grounds for doing so.

3.7 Similarly, if an application proposes the erection of permanent fencing, but the purposes of the fencing will be achieved within a reasonably predictable timescale, or the utility of the fencing should be reviewed from time to time because of its impact, the Welsh Ministers may decide to impose a condition requiring the works to be removed after a period of time, or refuse consent for the works.

3.8 Equally, if an application proposes the erection of temporary fencing to prevent livestock from wandering on to a road running through a common and causing accidents, the Welsh Ministers might want to know whether the applicant has explored the option of asking for a temporary speed limit to be introduced on the appropriate stretch of road to mitigate the risks of an accident whilst preserving the open nature of the land, or for warning signs to be introduced (*e.g.* warnings of cattle on road) that would have the effect of

slowing traffic down. If these were considered and rejected by the applicant as being ineffective, the Welsh Ministers might want to know why.

3.9 Looking at each of the criteria some of the considerations which should be taken into account include:

3.9.1 <u>the interests of persons having rights in relation to, or occupying the</u> <u>land (and in particular persons exercising rights of common over it)</u>

- What effect will the proposals have on the ability of commoners or other rights holders (including the landowner) to exercise their rights?
- What alternatives have been explored that might reduce the impact of the proposals on the exercise of commoners' rights?
- What effect will the proposals have on other rights holders, such as those with rights of access across the land?

3.9.2 the interests of the neighbourhood

- Does the proposed replacement land or outcome intended by the proposed works add something that will positively benefit the neighbourhood?
- Does the loss of the release land or the construction of the works mean that local people will be prevented from using the common or green in the way they are used to? For example, will the loss of the release land reduce the area of the cricket pitch below a viable threshold, or the works interfere with a regular riding circuit (particularly if any replacement land cannot mitigate the loss)?
- Does the construction of the works or, in relation to any exchange, will the removal of the release land from its status as common land or green, interfere with future use and enjoyment (whether by commoners, the public or others) of the land as a whole (*e.g.* will fencing sterilise part of the land, rendering it practically inaccessible)? Is it likely or possible that the release land could cease to be available as a means of access between other parts of the land as a whole (*e.g.* the removal of a vehicular access way from a green would enable the owner to fence off the access way from the green on either side, or otherwise exclude access to it)?

3.9.3 the public interest

The public interest is defined at sections 16(8) and 39(2) of the Act as including the public interest in nature conservation, the conservation of the landscape, the protection of public rights of access to any area of land, and the protection of archaeological remains and features of historic interest:

- What effect will the proposals have on those wishing to use the common for recreation and access? (In the case of any exchange, it should be assumed that the release land will cease to be available for recreation and access, unless a legally binding provision is intended to be made to assure continued use)
- Are there potential benefits to nature conservation from carrying out the proposals? Does Natural Resources Wales or any other competent person agree with the assessment of any proposed benefits? It may be appropriate to consider indirect benefits - for example, if the works will facilitate the continuation of sustainable grazing systems, which in turn deliver environmental benefits.
- In relation to any exchange, what will be the impact of the replacement land in relation to nature conservation compared with the release land? Does Natural Resources Wales or any other competent person agree with the assessment?
- What will be the impact on the landscape if the proposals proceed? Is the landscape in a specially designated area, such as a National Park or Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty? Will the impact include an adverse effect on the enjoyment of the remaining part of the common or green (*e.g.* if development of any release land might spoil the view or impair the conservation of wildlife on the remaining part)? What consideration has been given to minimising any impact by good design (*e.g.* in relation to a fencing scheme, minimising the extent of new fencing by utilising the existing boundaries of the common)?
- Will the proposals help protect archaeological remains and features of historic interest (particularly if there are such features on any land being deregistered)?
- How do the proposals fit into the historical context? For example, in relation to an ancient common, uniformly described in historical documentation with well-defined boundaries, what effect would they have on the local heritage?

3.9.4 any other matter considered to be relevant

This criterion allows other issues to be taken into account when assessing an application. It may include looking at the wider public interest, which may arise, for example in a major infrastructure project.

3.10 In assessing these considerations, the Welsh Ministers will take into account any matter which is relevant. They will not necessarily rely on the applicant, supporters and objectors to bring all such matters to their attention, but will also rely on their own experience and insight to draw appropriate conclusions. For example, they will not assume that, because no one objects to an application, that there are no adverse impacts, but will consider what impacts might arise, taking into account these criteria, and applying their

knowledge and experience, together with information available in representations, to make a judgement. If necessary, if there is doubt about the extent of any impact, they will consider using their powers to require a site visit or public inquiry, or to seek professional advice, in order to improve understanding of the merits of the application.

4 Other Policy Considerations

Exchange land in applications to deregister or exchange common land under section 16 of the 2006 Act

4.1 Applicants must propose replacement land if the area of the release land is over 200m² (see section 16(2)). Even in cases where the land to be deregistered is less than 200m² the Welsh Government expects land to be offered in exchange for the land being deregistered as our policy is not to allow our stock of common land and greens to diminish. The Welsh Government does not see the purpose of section 16 being to facilitate the deregistration of "unwanted" or "useless" pieces of common land or green; but to enable registered land to be released in exchange for replacement land of equal value.

4.2 In considering an application which does not propose replacement land, section 16(7) requires that the Welsh Ministers have "particular regard to the extent to which the absence of such a proposal is prejudicial" to the interests specified in section 16(6)(a) to (c) (*i.e.* the "private" interests, the interests of the neighbourhood, and the public interest referred to in paragraphs 3.9.1 to 3.9.3 above). In general, the Welsh Ministers will grant consent where no replacement land is offered only in exceptional circumstances. Such circumstances are most likely where a wider public interest is being served by the deregistration which may mitigate the prejudice caused by the loss of the release land. An example is the creation of a slipway for a lifeboat station, or the provision of a disabled access ramp to a village hall. Even in such cases, land should be offered in exchange unless there is a compelling reason why this is not possible (*e.g.* the registered land is surrounded by development, and it is not practicable to provide replacement land which would be integral to the site). It follows that an application for deregistration where no replacement land is offered is most unlikely to be granted if no public interest is served by the deregistration.

4.3 Nor does the Welsh Government see the purpose of section 16 as enabling the deregistration of land which is claimed to have been wrongly registered: other provision is made for that specific purpose in the 2006 Act.

4.4 In considering an application under section 16, the Welsh Ministers will assume that the release land is correctly registered. Where access to the release land is limited by inclosure (*e.g.* by a fence or hedge), or the release land is occupied by buildings or other works, they will assume that such inclosures or works are unlawful (unless the contrary is shown, *e.g.* by reason of a consent granted under section 194 of the Law of Property Act 1925) and that they will not endure. Accordingly, in those circumstances, they will

consider the proposed exchange as if the release land were an integral part of the common and properly available for public use.

4.5 Where it is proposed to offer land in exchange which is not contiguous with the common in which the release land is situated, the Welsh Ministers would expect to be provided with information on the following issues where applicable:-

- what rights or easements exist which would enable animals to be moved from existing common land to that offered in exchange eg how would access across private land be obtained?;
- how would the movement of animals over different commons affect the rights and usage of those with existing rights on different commons? There could be the danger of interfering with existing rights eg overgrazing, prevention of those persons with existing rights from grazing animals etc, and information would be required as to how those risks would be avoided;
- where animals would be moved over private land and/or different commons, what steps would be taken to avoid the risk of any diseases spreading to/from the other land and/or from one flock or herd to another?

Works on commons under section 38 of the 2006 Act

4.6 Commons should be maintained or improved as a result of the works being proposed on them. The Welsh Government sees Part 3 of the 2006 Act, and its predecessor provision in section 194 of the Law of Property Act 1925, as conferring additional protection on common land, rather than enabling common land to be used for purposes inconsistent with its origin, status and character. In other words, consent under section 38 should be seen as a gateway, which enables the construction of works which are sympathetic to our policy objectives for common land, but reinforces controls on development which are inappropriate or harmful.

4.7 In deciding whether to grant consent to carry out works on common land, the Welsh Ministers (and Inspectors) will wish to establish whether the proposed works are consistent with the use of the land as common land. For example, an application for works which facilitate grazing of a common by a rights holder will be considered to be consistent with the future use of the land as common land, whereas an application for works to extend a private dwelling onto common land will be considered not to be consistent with the future use of the land as common land, and will normally be refused.

4.8 Where it is proposed to construct or improve a driveway across a common, consent will be required under section 38 if the works involve the "laying of concrete, tarmacadam, coated roadstone or similar material" (other than for the purposes of repair of the same material). Such an application

may be consistent with the continuing use of the land as common land, even where the driveway is entirely for private benefit, because the construction will not in itself prevent public access, or access for commoners animals. By its very nature, however, paving will have an impact on the enjoyment of the common by reducing the area available for recreation and grazing, by removing habitat, perhaps by affecting drainage, and introducing an urbanising feature into what will normally be an essentially open and natural setting. Nevertheless, the Welsh Government takes the view that, in some circumstances, a paved driveway may be the only practical means of achieving access to land adjacent to the common or green. Moreover, where an existing unsurfaced means of access is already in use, a sympathetic paving proposal may be aesthetically preferable.

4.9 The Welsh Government also notes that the alternative of deregistration of the land covered by a drive, and the substitution of replacement land elsewhere, may be undesirable in that the release land ceases to be subject to statutory protection, and may cease to be available to the community (the potential impact of deregistration may be greater where the release land is core or integral to the enjoyment of the common or green as a whole). These issues will vary according to the particular circumstances and no general rule can be formulated.

4.10 The Welsh Ministers generally have no power to grant consent to construct or improve a driveway across a town or village green, and the construction and subsequent use of such a driveway may well be illegal. Where it is intended to construct a vehicular means of access across a green, the Welsh Government notes that an application may be required under section 16 to deregister the affected land, but where such an application relates to an area of the green which is not more than 200m² in area, the principles set out in paragraph 4.1 to 4.5 above (in relation to the provision of exchange land) will apply.

4.11 Consent will not normally be granted under section 38 for permanent buildings on common land, because such development is normally incompatible with the future use of the land as common land. Where such buildings are intrinsically related to the enjoyment or management of the common, however, such as a cricket pavilion, lambing shed or a keeper's hut, the giving of consent under section 38 may be considered appropriate.

Underlying public benefit

4.12 Some proposed works on common land do not benefit the common but nevertheless there is a potential underlying public benefit, for example works for the generation of sustainable energy (wind farms).

4.13 The Welsh Government wishes to promote sustainable energy generation in an appropriate setting but, equally, its policy is to ensure that the stock of commons is not diminished, that works on common land must maintain or improve the condition of the common, and the use must be consistent with its status as common land. To balance these issues the

Welsh Government's expectation is that applications for such infrastructure projects on common land are more likely to be successful under section 16 of the Act, so that an exchange of land is proposed and can be taken into account. An application for consent to such works under section 38 will rarely be granted unless there are convincing reasons why an application under section 16 cannot be pursued.

4.14 Similarly, works may be proposed in relation to common land which do not benefit the common, but confer some wider benefit on the local community, such as minor works undertaken by a statutory undertaker (*e.g.* a water utility) to provide or improve the public service to local residents and businesses. In such cases, the Welsh Government's expectation is that applications for such purposes on common land are more likely to be successful under section 16 of the Act, so that an exchange of land is proposed and can be taken into account. An application for consent to such works under section 38 will rarely be granted unless there are convincing reasons why an application under section 16 cannot be pursued. Exceptionally, however, consent may be appropriate where the works are of temporary duration (such as a worksite) or where the works will be installed underground (such as a pipeline or pumping station), and the proposals ensure the full restoration of the land affected, and the works confer a public benefit.

Applications not within scope of section 38

4.15 Applications which are not appropriate to proceed under section 38 may often be eligible to be considered under section 16. In certain cases, however, it may be possible or more appropriate to make application under other provisions:

- Powers of compulsory purchase or (in relation to a local authority) appropriation, for which purposes the Welsh Ministers' certificate is required under the Acquisition of Land Act 1981, section 19 or paragraph 6 of Schedule 3 these powers may be exercised only by a local authority or other body on which such powers are conferred (such as under an Act of Parliament), and may also be used to acquire rights over common land (*e.g.* a right to bury a pipeline in the land and to confer enduring rights of access for maintenance) instead of a right to acquire the land itself.
- National Trust Act 1971, section 23: in relation to works on common land owned by the National Trust.
- Countryside Act 1968, section 9: facilities and buildings undertaken by local authorities on common land or neighbouring land in interests of promoting public access.
- Dyfed Act 1987, sections 42 and 65; access over greens and rights over Kingsmoor Common

4.16 Applications under these other statutory régimes are subject to the same policy considerations set out in this guidance in so far as the considerations are compatible with the requirements of the specific legislation.

General policy in relation to consent

4.17 This guidance explains the Welsh Government's policy in relation to consents generally. It should not be assumed that, where this guidance indicates that a consent might be appropriate in the circumstances specified, that an application in those circumstances will necessarily be granted. Such applications will be considered on their merits in relation to the context, this guidance, and specifically that any works proposed should maintain or improve the use of the land as a common or town or village green and the criteria set out in the relevant legislation. Although many proposals are linked to, or are a central part to, a related consent for planning permission, the issues that need to be considered are guite different, as what may be perfectly reasonable from a planning perspective, may, or could, have an adverse impact on the traditional use of the land as The Welsh Government, where possible, wishes to a common or green. protect and conserve the stock of common land and greens and where appropriate to promote its protection and its continued use for traditional activities.

Matters to be taken into account

4.18 In considering any application for consent (or for a certificate), the Welsh Ministers will have regard to the following matters:

- Their duty to conserve biodiversity (see section 40 of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006), and their duty to further the conservation of the section 41 list of features of principal importance for conserving biodiversity;
- Their duty (in relation to land designated as a site of special scientific interest), "to take reasonable steps, consistent with the proper exercise of the authority's functions, to further the conservation and enhancement of the flora, fauna or geological or physiographical features by reason of which the site is of special scientific interest" (see section 28G of the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981);
- Their duty to have regard to the requirements of the Habitats Directive so far as they may be affected by the exercise of those functions; in particular, it may be necessary for an appropriate assessment to be carried out before a consent may be granted for works which are likely to have a significant effect on an area designated as a special area of conservation under the Habitats Directive or as a special protection area

under the Wild Birds Directive (see The Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2010 (SI 2010/490));

- Their duty (in relation to a National Park) to have regard to the purposes for which National Parks are established, and if it appears that there is a conflict between those purposes (of the national park), the requirement to attach greater weight to the purpose of conserving and enhancing the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the area comprised in the National Park (see section 11A of the National Parks and Access to the Countryside Act 1949); and
- Their duty (in relation to an area of outstanding natural beauty) to have regard to the purpose of conserving and enhancing the natural beauty of the area of outstanding natural beauty (see section 85 of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000).

5 Enforcement against unlawful works

- 5.1 Any person (including an incorporated body or local authority) may seek enforcement action against unlawful works by application to the county court under section 41 of the 2006 Act. The Welsh Government has published guidance on taking such action. Unlawful works means works which require consent under section 38, but which have not received such consent.
- 5.2 Responsibility for the enforcement of the requirement for consent set out in Part 3 of the 2006 Act lies with the local community. Enforcement action may be taken by any local authority (including a community council and a National Park authority), as well as by members of the public and persons representing civic, amenity and recreational bodies. The Welsh Ministers will take enforcement action in the case of any breach in exceptional circumstances only as, in their view, it is more appropriate for action to be taken by those persons whose rights have been affected.

Appendix 3

Photographs of the Temporary Construction Area

Easterly Borrow Pits





Northerly Borrow Pit



Westerly Borrow Pit





Turbine 1











Turbine 2










































Substation



Appendix 4

Ecology Technical Note for the Temporary Construction Area

BSG ecology

Application under Section 38 of the Commons Act

Temporary works areas will be needed for the construction compound and borrow pits and will additionally take in areas of approximately 5 m width alongside the tracks, around the turbine bases / their hardstandings.

The construction compound, the north-westerly turbine, one of the borrow pits and associated sections of access track will be located in heavily sheep-grazed acid grassland. This is a very low value habitat that is fairly ubiquitous in upland areas. Temporary works associated with the remainder of the wind farm will result in land take from more ecologically valuable habitats, such as dry heath and dry heath / acid grassland mosaics, as well as from bracken dominated areas on the periphery of the wind farm site. These habitats are extremely widespread on the Site. Temporary land take will have a negligible impact on their extent. They are not groundwater dependent or otherwise ecologically sensitive, and would be expected to re-establish rapidly following the completion of works. It is unlikely that any works would be needed to assist this re-establishment, but in the event the areas were slow to recover, re-seeding with heather could be undertaken as part of measures delivered as part of RES's commitment to long term habitat management on the Site. Any works required would be undertaken by RES and delivered by the commoners.

Derbyshire Oxford Newcastle Newport Swansea Cambridge | BSG Ecology is a trading name of BSG Ecology Ltd Registered in: England and Wales | No. 12142513 | Registered address: Merlin House No.1 Langstone Business Park Newport NP18 2HJ

Appendix 5

Hefting Plan

